Journal for the Child Development, Exceptionality and Education, 5(2), 103-115, June 2024 e-ISSN: 2757-7554
jcdee.com

Genc Bilge Publishing Ltd. (Young Wise) © 2024
gencbilgeyayincilik.com

Research Article

Analysis of child development undergraduate program: Turkiye case

Ahmet Mert Demir[1] and Gokhan Ilgaz[2]*

Curriculum Development and Instruction Department, Faculty of Education, Edirne, Turkiye

Article Info

Received: 7 September 2024
Accepted: 28 November 2024
Online: 30 Dec 2024

Keywords
Child development undergradua program
Course information package
Program qualifications

Abstract

This study aims to examine the components of undergraduate child development programs in Turkey. Data were collected through document analysis of the course information packages available on universities' Bologna Process websites, using a case study design. The program qualifications, courses, learning outcomes, course contents, recommended strategies, methods, techniques, and assessment approaches were compiled and analyzed. Bloom's Taxonomy was used to analyze program qualifications and learning outcomes. The Turkish Higher Education Qualifications Framework (TQF) and the National Core Curriculum for Undergraduate Child Development Education (NCCCDE) served as the basis for analyzing courses and content. The frequency of recommended strategies, methods, techniques, and assessment approaches was also examined, and findings were discussed in the literature. Results indicated that while program qualifications aimed at higher-level tendencies, the learning outcomes focused more on lower-level tendencies, showing a lack of alignment. Although the number of mandatory courses slightly exceeded those recommended by NCCCDE, it was deemed acceptable. The distribution of mandatory courses aligned with NCCCDE, while elective courses varied. Course content was found to span health, educational sciences, and social services, as outlined in the TQF. Teacher-centered methods dominated the recommended teaching strategies, and traditional approaches were prevalent in assessment and evaluation methods.

To cite this article

Demir, A.M., and Ilgaz, G. (2024). Analysis of child development undergraduate program: Turkiye case. *Journal for the Child Development, Exceptionality and Education, 5*(2), 93-101. DOI: https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.1

Introduction

It can be said that improving quality in education is one of the most important tasks of educational institutions. All activities related to education in primary, secondary, and higher education institutions are implemented not randomly but according to a pre-prepared and planned program. The objectives to be achieved for individuals, the topics to be addressed, how these topics will be taught to students, and how the training will be evaluated are all based on the implemented program. It is anticipated that the quality of education will improve through the elimination of deficiencies in the implemented programs and their reorganization in light of scientific, technological, and contemporary developments, i.e., through program development.

The 21st-century higher education system requires a scientific perspective to reveal the value of global knowledge through academic studies, collaboration with the industrial sector in the light of economic theories, and an entrepreneurial outlook. To meet this need, the Bologna Process was initiated in the European Union Region. The Bologna Process is a restructuring initiative for higher education systems, aiming to create the European Higher

[1] Teacher, Ministry of National Education of Turkiye, Edirne, Turkiye. E-mail: ahmetmertdemir88@gmail.com ORCID: 0000-0001-7734-1127
[2] Correspondşng Author: Assoc.Prof., Curriculum Development and Instruction Department, Faculty of Education, Edirne, Turkiye. E-mail: gokhani@trakya.edu.tr ORCID: 0000-0001- 8988-5279

Education Area (EHEA), where programs are comparable, competitive, and transparently presented, to meet the ever-changing educational needs.

As of 2024, the Bologna Process, continued by 49 member countries, was publicly introduced in 1999. The Republic of Turkey joined the Bologna Process with the 2001 Prague Declaration. After years of work, the Bologna Process has primarily focused on international mobility, establishing common degree systems (undergraduate and postgraduate), lifelong learning, the European Credit Transfer System (ECTS), ensuring quality assurance, addressing the social dimension of education, and promoting employability. Within these dimensions, countries participating in the Bologna Process have revised their higher education systems. These revisions typically have a competency-based outcome focus, emphasizing the educational needs of enrolled students (Durman, Elmas, Kurt, and Kenar, 2011). Moreover, the Bologna Process places the learner at the center, continuously improving the quality assurance system through its application based on learning outcomes (Elmas, 2012).

With the Bologna Process, in which Turkey also participates, the Turkish Higher Education Qualifications Framework was first established. Subsequently, National Core Curricula were developed to achieve higher education at European standards. Based on these programs, universities prepared their Bologna course information packages for their departments, developing competencies for departments and programs for individual courses.

The 21st century can be considered an era of rapid changes. Adapting to these changes requires equipping individuals with the unique skills and values of this century. As in every century, it is believed that acquiring these skills and values will be possible through the leading role of education. Developing critical and innovative thinking individuals who seek, create, and utilize knowledge and creating educational programs and environments that bring out these qualities can make this achievable. In 2016, the Higher Education Council organized the National Core Education Program for Child Development Undergraduate Education to train individuals who can adapt to contemporary changes and developments. Based on this core program, each Child Development department has started implementing its own programs.

This research aims to deeply understand the competencies, compliance with the framework program, learning outcomes, content, and teaching-learning processes of undergraduate-level child development programs. Studies in different fields often use mixed research methods (Başgönül, 2014; Kızılkaya-Namlı, 2018; Tekin, 2011). However, this study employed a qualitative research method to provide a deeper understanding and analysis of undergraduate child development programs. Due to the limited studies on this subject in the literature, this study is expected to contribute to the literature and to the program development of child development departments and the Higher Education Council's program development units. It also aims to identify the strengths and weaknesses of undergraduate child development programs.

As in all countries, it can be said that child development education holds a significant place in fostering individuals' cognitive, physical, social, linguistic, and motor development in Turkey. As a discipline performing such critical functions, child development education is delivered through various structures (formal and non-formal education) and programs (certificate, high school, associate, and undergraduate programs). One of these programs is undergraduate child development programs. Considering that program development is an ongoing process and involves updates based on feedback to address deficiencies, examining existing programs in program development studies holds a significant place. For this purpose, the undergraduate child development programs of universities in Turkey were analyzed using document analysis in this study.

Aim of Study

This study aims to analyze the undergraduate child development programs offered at universities in Turkey. The research problem is designed as, "What are the characteristics of undergraduate child development programs at universities in Turkiye?"

The research aims to address the following questions regarding the undergraduate child development programs at universities in Turkiye:

- Thoug How are program competencies distributed according to Bloom's Taxonomy?

- What are the courses included in the programs, and how are the learning outcomes of these courses distributed according to Bloom's Taxonomy?
- What is the level of alignment between program competencies and the learning outcomes of the courses?
- According to the Turkish Qualifications Framework for Higher Education, which educational fields are covered by the course contents?
- What are the proposed teaching strategies, methods, and techniques for the courses included in the programs?
- What are the assessment and evaluation approaches for the courses in the programs?

Method

Research Design

The aim of this study is to examine undergraduate child development education programs in Turkey. For this purpose, the study is designed as a case study, which is one of the qualitative research designs. Qualitative research is defined as a type of research that uses qualitative data collection tools such as observation, interviews, and document analysis, examining perceptions and events in a holistic way in their natural environment (Demirbaş, 2014). A case study is a qualitative research method in which researchers use multiple data collection tools to conduct an in-depth investigation of one or more cases within a limited context (Creswell, 2007).

The data in this research were collected using the document analysis method. Document analysis is a systematic examination and interpretation of written materials prepared in written form. This method allows researchers to collect and analyze data from existing documents (Bowen, 2009). In this study, course information packages for child development undergraduate programs were classified and finalized after expert review.

Data Collection Tools

The data for this study were obtained from Bologna Course Information Packages available on the official websites of universities. From these information packages, program competencies, courses, course learning outcomes, topics, proposed strategies, methods, or techniques, and assessment and evaluation approaches were gathered as dimensions. Additionally, this study was conducted based on the decision numbered 01 and dated October 20, 2021, made during the 08th session of Trakya University Social and Human Sciences Research Ethics Committee.

All these steps were carried out according to document analysis, one of the data collection tools in the case study design. Documents are essential data sources in social sciences due to their easy accessibility, diverse information, and availability for historical data collection. Documents are generally prepared as a result of a purposeful activity, and researchers try to make sense of the activities described in these documents (Sözer & Aydın, 2020). Document analysis encompasses the analysis of written documents containing information about the events and phenomena to be investigated (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2021). It is a method of collecting data from existing records and documents, systematically examining these as sources for data preparation (Best, 2016).

In qualitative research, documents are materials that need to be effectively utilized. Researchers can obtain the data they need without conducting observations or interviews, saving time and money (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2021). If the data collection process in research is seen as a step to enable interpretation, it should be acknowledged that original scientific research can also be conducted through document analysis (Karasar, 2020). The significance of the documents as a data source depends on the problem being investigated. For example, in a study in the field of education, textbooks, prepared programs, and official documents related to students and teachers may be used (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2021). The key feature of this method is the interaction between the researcher and the document (Karasar, 2020). In this study, educational materials from the Bologna Course Information Packages of universities were analyzed.

Document analysis can be conducted in five stages (Forster, 1995; cited in Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2013):

- Accessing the Documents
- Checking the Originality
- Interpreting the Documents
- Analyzing the Data

- Using the Data

Data Analysis

In this research, documents were analyzed using descriptive analysis. In descriptive analysis, the obtained data are first described systematically and clearly. Then, these descriptions are explained and interpreted, cause-and-effect relationships are identified, and some conclusions are drawn (Çepni, 2021). Within this scope, the data were analyzed as follows: program qualifications, courses, course learning outcomes, topics, teaching methods and techniques, and assessment and evaluation approaches were selected from the Bologna Course Information Packages and prepared in a table for analysis. Program qualifications and learning outcomes were categorized based on Bloom's Taxonomy into cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains, and their levels were determined. Courses were assessed for their compatibility with the National Core Curriculum for Higher Education Programs (NCCCDE). Topics were matched with the fundamental educational areas in the Turkish Qualifications Framework (TYYÇ). The most commonly used teaching methods, techniques, and assessment and evaluation approaches were analyzed to determine their underlying perspectives.

To determine the inter-coder reliability of the classification form used in the study, six course information packages were randomly selected. Three program development experts coded these packages independently based on a predefined template. To evaluate the consistency among coders, the reliability method recommended by Miles and Huberman (1994) was applied. Reliability was calculated as 0.95. According to Yıldırım and Şimşek (2021), values of 70% or higher are considered sufficient for reliability. This result indicates consistency among coders and establishes the reliability of the coding process.

Findings

This section presents the findings categorized under program qualifications, courses, course learning outcomes, suggested strategies, methods or techniques, and assessment and evaluation approaches, as identified in the course packages of selected universities. The data on program qualifications were analyzed based on Bloom's Taxonomy, considering domains and levels, and presented in tables below.

Table 1. Distribution of program qualifications by domain based on Bloom's taxonomy

	Cognitive	Affective	Psychomotor	Error	Total
f	386	126	1	3	516
%	74,81	24,42	0,19	0,58	100

Table 1 indicates that among a total of 46 universities in Turkey, including both public and private ones, 10 Child Development Bachelor's Programs could not be analyzed as they have not yet produced graduates, and course information packages for one program were inaccessible. Of the remaining 35 child development bachelor's programs with graduates, a total of 516 program qualifications were identified, the majority of which (74.81%) fall within the cognitive domain. However, program qualifications in the affective domain (24.42%) and psychomotor domain (0.19%), which are expected to have a higher presence in child development programs, were found to be below the anticipated levels. Moreover, program qualifications with errors in writing principles accounted for 0.58%.

Table 2. The distribution of program qualifications based on Bloom's taxonomy levels

Domain	Level (%)						
	Knowledge	Comprehension	Application	Analysis	Synthesis	Evaluation	Error
Cognitive	12,95	3,89	52,08	2,07	15,28	13,47	0,26
Affective	Receiving	Responding	Valuing	Organizing	Internalizing		Error
	0,79	15,88	7,95	5,55	68,25		1,58
Psychomotor	Perception	Set	Guided Response	Mechanism	Complex Overt Response	Adaptation	Origination
	0	0	0	0	100	0	0

According to the findings presented in Table 2, when program qualifications are analyzed based on Bloom's taxonomy levels, it was found that in the cognitive domain, the highest percentage belongs to the application level (52.08%), followed by the evaluation level (15.28%) and the synthesis level (13.47%). The presence of higher-level qualifications within the cognitive domain is considered a positive aspect. However, the analysis level has the lowest proportion.

In the affective domain, the highest percentage belongs to the internalizing values level (68.25%), followed by responding to phenomena (15.88%) and valuing (7.95%). The highest percentage at the internalizing values level, which represents the highest stage in the affective domain, is also evaluated as a positive aspect.

In the psychomotor domain, there is only one program qualification at the skilled performance level. It can be concluded that the number of program qualifications in the psychomotor domain is insufficient.

Data on learning outcomes have been analyzed based on Bloom's taxonomy in terms of domain and level, and the findings are presented in the tables below.

Table 3. The distribution of correctly written learning outcomes based on bloom's taxonomy domains

	Cognitive	Affective	Psychomotor	Total
(f)	11852	452	29	12333
%	96,10	3,66	0,24	100

Among the 2,544 courses examined, it was found that 333 courses (13.09%) did not have any learning outcomes. A total of 12,585 learning outcomes were identified for 2,211 courses. Upon examination, 252 (2%) of these outcomes were found to be incorrect. Of the remaining 12,333 learning outcomes, 11,852 (96.10%) were determined to belong to the cognitive domain.

Additionally, 452 outcomes (3.66%) were identified in the affective domain, and 29 outcomes (0.24%) in the psychomotor domain.

Table 4. The distribution of correctly written learning outcomes based on Bloom's taxonomy levels

Domain	Level (%)						
	Knowledge	Comprehension	Application	Analysis	Synthesis	Evaluation	
Cognitive	31,85	30,65	21,10	9,48	2,43	4,49	
Affective	Receiving	Responding	Valuing	Organizing	Internalizing		
	26,56	28,79	14,29	3,57	26,79		
Psychomotor	Perception	Set	Guided Response	Mechanism	Complex Overt Response	Adaptation	Origination
	13,79	0	0	3,45	82,76	0	0

Taxonomic analysis revealed that some learning outcomes in a particular domain were associated with multiple levels. Consequently, 14 learning outcomes were marked as incorrect due to complexity, resulting in a total of 266 incorrect learning outcomes. The remaining outcomes were analyzed according to their domain-level distribution, with results presented in Table 4.

When analyzing learning outcomes by domain and level:

- In the cognitive domain, the highest proportion was found at the knowledge level (31.85%), followed by comprehension (30.65%) and application (21.10%). Higher-level learning outcomes in this domain were underrepresented.
- In the affective domain, the highest proportion was at the responding level (28.79%), followed by receiving (26.56%) and valuing (14.29%). Higher-level learning outcomes in this domain were similarly underrepresented.
- In the psychomotor domain, the majority were at the skillful performance level (82.76%), followed by perception (13.79%) and mechanism (3.45%). Higher-level learning outcomes in this domain were minimal.

Data collected on the alignment of learning outcomes with program qualifications were analyzed and presented in tabular form.

Table 5. Compatibility between program competencies and learning outcomes

	Number of Learning Outcomes	Compatibility Percentage
Below Average	2415	34,14
Average	2737	38,69
Above Average	2255	31,88
None	5511	
Total	12585	

When Table 5 is examined, it was determined that for the remaining 12,585 learning outcomes (excluding 333 courses without learning outcomes), there was no compatibility between 5,511 (43.79%) learning outcomes and program outputs. This ratio highlights the need for meticulous preparation of matrices regarding the relationship between program competencies and learning outcomes. For the remaining 7,074 learning outcomes, the average compatibility between courses and programs was found to be 53.57%. It was observed that this compatibility is mostly at an average level (38.69%), with some above average (31.88%). Thus, it can be said that the majority of compatibility is either below or equal to the average.

The compulsory–elective status of the courses and their comparison with the National Core Education Program (NCCCDE) were examined. Additionally, the alignment of course contents with the fundamental education areas in the Turkish Higher Education Qualifications Framework (THEQF) was investigated.

Table 6. Status of the Examined Courses as Compulsory or Elective

	Compulsory Courses (f)	Elective Courses (f)
Public	958	708
Foundation	530	343
Total	1488	1051

When Table 6 is analyzed, the total number of courses was determined to be 2,539. Among these, 1,488 (58.60%) were identified as compulsory, while 1,051 (41.40%) were elective. Of the compulsory courses, 958 (64.38%) were offered at public universities, and 530 (35.62%) at private universities. For elective courses, 708 (67.36%) were at public universities, and 343 (32.64%) at private universities. No elective courses were identified in open education faculties within the child development programs at public universities. It can be said that the number of compulsory courses is higher than that of elective courses. The framework outlined by NCCCDE also emphasizes the predominance of compulsory courses.

Table 7. Distribution of the Most Frequent Compulsory Courses

Compulsory Courses	*f*	Compulsory Courses	*f*
Anatomy	24	Biostatistics	21
Physiology	24	Introduction to Child Development	21
Pediatric Health and Diseases	23	Developmental Psychopathology	17

When Table 7 is examined, it is observed that the most frequent compulsory courses are Anatomy, Physiology, and Pediatric Health and Diseases. It can be stated that these align with the compulsory courses recommended in NCCCDE.

Table 8. Distribution of the most frequent elective courses

Elective Courses	*f*	Elective Courses	*f*
Children and Music	15	Gifted Children	11
Children's Literature	14	Creative Drama	11
Children and Media	14	Parent Relation and Bullying	10

When Table 8 is examined, it is observed that the most frequent elective courses are "Children and Music," "Children's Literature," and "Children and Media." Although these do not align with the elective courses recommended in NCCCDE, it is stated in NCCCDE that each university may determine elective courses compatible with their unique programs. Therefore, it can be inferred that the names of elective courses may vary.

Table 9. Distribution of courses according to THEQF educational and instructional core areas

	Educational Sciences *(f)*	Social Service *(f)*	Health *(f)*
Elective	520	279	252
Compulsory	515	224	749
Total	1035	503	1001

Out of the 2539 courses analyzed, 1035 (%40.77) were associated with educational sciences, 1001 (%39.42) with health, and 503 (%19.81) with the social services field. Among the 1488 compulsory courses, 749 (%50.34) were related to the health field, 515 (%34.61) to the education field, and 224 (%15.05) to the social services field. Out of the 1051 elective courses, 520 (%49.48) were associated with the education field, 279 (%26.55) with social services, and 252 (%23.97) with the health field, as presented in Table 9. Considering that child development undergraduate programs are generally established within faculties or schools related to health, it can be stated that courses related to the health field dominate among compulsory courses. However, it can also be stated that courses involving educational activities in this field, which is closely related to education, are offered as elective courses.

Table 10. Distribution of course statuses

Course statuses	Theory	Theory- laboratory	Theory- Pratice	Practical	Total
(f)	2141	2	264	122	2534
(%)	84,66	0,08	10,44	4,82	100

In the analysis of 2539 courses, 5 courses (0.39%) did not specify their status regarding theory, practice, or laboratory work. Out of the remaining 2534 courses, 2141 (84.66%) were theoretical, 264 (10.44%) were both theoretical and practical, 122 (4.82%) were practical, and 2 (0.08%) were both theoretical and laboratory courses. This situation is shown in Table 10. In a field like child development, which requires significant practical application, the predominance of theoretical courses may negatively impact the training of child development specialists graduating from this program.

Table 11. The orientation of course content toward theory or practice

	Theory-oriented	**Practice-oriented**	**Total**
(f)	22390	1836	24226
(%)	92,44	7,56	100,0

Among the 2539 courses analyzed, it was found that the topics were not written in 307 courses, and there were errors in 18 courses (where content belonging to another course was written instead). In the remaining 2214 courses, a total of 24,551 topics were identified. After removing incorrect and non-existent topics, a total of 24,226 valid topics were identified. Of these identified topics, 22,390 (92.42%) were theoretical, and 1,836 (7.56%) were practical, as shown in Table 11. These findings reveal that the majority of course content is theory-oriented. It can be suggested that practice-oriented course content should be further developed, considering the requirements of the child development undergraduate program.

Table 12. Distribution of course content by THEQF educational and ınstructional core areas

	Educational Sciences	**Health**	**Social Science**	**Total**
(f)	9833	8538	5855	24226
(%)	40,59	35,24	24,17	100

When examining Table 12, the field of Child Development is considered as an area where the topics of health, educational sciences, and social services intersect. When the topic distribution is analyzed in terms of health, educational sciences, and social services areas, out of 24,226 topics, 9,833 (40.59%) are related to the education field, 8,538 (35.24%) to the health field, and 5,855 (24.17%) to the social services field. Since the number of elective courses in university programs is greater than the available elective courses, all elective courses were reviewed for this study, and it can be said that the field of educational sciences is more prominent in the course contents due to the larger number of educational sciences courses in the elective courses.

Table 13. Distribution of theory and application-oriented course contents with THEQF educational teaching areas

	Educational Sciences *(f)*	**Health *(f)***	**Social Service *(f)***
Theory-oriented	8507	8267	5616
Application-oriented	1326	271	239
Total	9833	8538	5855

According to Table 13, when the topics related to theory and application are analyzed together with the educational sciences, health, and social services fields, out of 24,226 topics related to theory, 8,507 (37.99%) belong to the field of educational sciences, 8,267 (36.93%) to health, and 5,616 (25.08%) to social services. For application-oriented topics, out of 1,836 topics, 1,326 (72.22%) belong to education, 239 (13.02%) to social services, and 271 (14.76%) to health. While there is a balanced distribution of theory-oriented topics in health and educational sciences, the application-oriented topics are predominantly in the field of educational sciences.

The proposed teaching strategies, methods, or techniques have been examined, and the findings are presented in a table and interpreted.

Table 14. Distribution of proposed teaching strategies, methods, or techniques

Method/ Technique	*f*	*%*	*Method/ Technique*	*f*	*%*	*Method/ Technique*	*f*	*%*
Lecture	631	23,53	Drama	22	0,82	Game-Based Learning	3	0,11
Discussion	471	17,56	Six Thinking Hats	19	0,71	Video-Based Learning	3	0,11
Question and Answer	358	13,35	Creative Thinking	19	0,71	Reflective Thinking	3	0,11
Case Study	202	7,53	Field Work	15	0,56	Analogy	2	0,07
Brainstorming	172	6,41	Report Writing	8	0,30	Workshop	2	0,07
Individual Work	107	3,99	Excursion	7	0,26	Interview	2	0,07
Group Work	102	3,80	Internship	7	0,26	Debate	2	0,07
Project-Based Learning	71	2,65	Seminar	5	0,19	Synectics	2	0,07
Problem Solving	68	2,54	Web-Based Learning	5	0,19	Supervision	2	0,07
Observation	64	2,39	Experiment	4	0,15	Counter Panel	2	0,07
Reading	47	1,75	Small Group Discussion	4	0,15	Active Learning	1	0,04
Case Study	47	1,75	Laboratory	4	0,15	Research	1	0,04
Application	45	1,68	Outside-Class Work	4	0,15	Thinking Workshop	1	0,04
Assignment	41	1,53	Divergence and Convergence	3	0,11	Panel	1	0,04
Role Playing	36	1,34	Brain-Based Learning	3	0,11	SCAMPER	1	0,04
Demonstration	29	1,08	Large Group Discussion	3	0,11	Scenario-Based Learning	1	0,04
Show and Tell	27	1,01	Opinion Development	3	0,11			

Upon reviewing Table 14, it is found that 1775 out of 2539 courses (69.90%) lack any information regarding the strategy, method, or technique. Among the remaining 764 courses (30.10%), 25 have errors in the strategy, method, or technique. In the 739 courses where these were correctly specified, a total of 2682 strategies, methods, or techniques were identified. The most frequently used strategies, methods, or techniques were as follows: explanation (631 instances, 23.53%), discussion (471 instances, 17.56%), and question-answer (358 instances, 13.35%).

Considering that a significant number of courses lack any information about strategies, methods, or techniques, it can be suggested that the committees reviewing the course information packages should pay attention to this matter once the packages are prepared. Additionally, the remaining courses typically suggested well-known, traditional teaching

strategies, methods, or techniques. This could negatively impact the learning processes of students in child development undergraduate programs who need to be effectively trained through education.

Table 15. Distribution of measurement and evaluation approaches

Approach	*f*	*%*	*Approach*	*f*	*%*	*Approach*	*f*	*%*
Assignment	535	45,08	Seminar	7	0,60	Discussion	2	0,16
Quiz	134	11,30	Oral	7	0,60	Field Trip	1	0,08
Project	133	11,20	Observation	6	0,52	Computer-Assisted Presentation	1	0,08
Application	129	10,86	Performance	4	0,34	Laboratory	1	0,08
Class Attendance	85	7,16	Group Work	3	0,26	Article Review	1	0,08
Presentation	78	6,57	Peer Evaluation	2	0,16	Role Playing	1	0,08
Report	41	3,45	Internship	2	0,16	Expert Evaluation	1	0,08
Field Work	13	1,10						

Out of 2539 courses, 552 (21.74%) do not contain any information regarding assessment and evaluation. Among the remaining 1987 courses (78.26%), 15 have incorrect entries related to assessment and evaluation. The midterm notation found in 1802 courses was excluded from the analysis as it is not considered an assessment technique. Among the remaining correctly stated courses, 1193 assessments were identified. The most common assessment techniques identified were assignments (535 cases, 45.08%) and quizzes (134 cases, 11.30%). Since the final exam is a legal requirement in all courses and nearly every course includes a midterm exam, which is not considered an assessment technique, it was excluded from the analysis, as shown in Table 15.

When examining assessment and evaluation approaches, it is evident that traditional approaches are predominantly adopted. Given the importance of child evaluation, it can be argued that child development professionals trained in this field would benefit from being evaluated through different approaches, which would contribute positively to their professional development.

Conclusion and Discussion

In the review, tables have been presented in detail for clearer understanding. The results are summarized below. In this section, the findings derived from the tables, research sub-problems, and the literature have been discussed, and the conclusions have been drawn.

According to the research, each university's program qualifications, courses, course contents, learning outcomes, methods, techniques, and assessment approaches differ. Each university has applied its own methods and techniques. In this case, it can be understood that although the Child Development department exists in different universities, the program qualifications, courses, course contents, learning outcomes, strategies and methods, and assessment approaches vary.

Looking at the findings of the research, it was found that the majority of program qualifications are in the cognitive domain. When examining the steps of the cognitive domain, it was determined that the most frequent ones were application, evaluation, and synthesis, in that order. From the cognitive domain perspective, it can be said that a curriculum emphasizing higher-order cognitive actions is designed in the Child Development bachelor's programs. Regarding the affective domain, although the number of program outputs is smaller than in the cognitive domain, the most frequent steps were found to be characterizing, responding, and valuing. It can be said that although fewer program qualifications are targeted in the affective domain, higher-order tendencies are designed in the Child Development bachelor's programs. Regarding the psychomotor domain, it was determined that the program output was inadequate with only one output at the skill development level. This is considered insufficient because the fundamental concepts guiding the field of child development include cognitive, language, motor, social, and emotional development rules (NCCCDE, 2016). Therefore, more emphasis should be placed on program qualifications in the psychomotor domain, as well as in the cognitive, language, social, and emotional domains. This study found that the psychomotor domain

qualification was at the higher skill development level. As a result, it can be said that program qualifications are insufficient in the important domains of emotional and psychomotor development for a child's growth. However, when considering the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains together, it is observed that the program outputs are generally high-level program outcomes. According to Tekin (1996), as one moves from the knowledge level to the evaluation level, behaviors become more complex, and acquiring these behaviors becomes more difficult. In bachelor's programs that mainly aim for higher-order tendencies, students are likely to have tendencies related to critical thinking and inquiry. Similar results have been found in different bachelor's programs. For example, Esen and Yaman (2021) studied the higher-order learning areas of Bloom's Taxonomy in Business Bachelor's Programs and stated that program outputs related to creative thinking and innovation were included. Regarding the findings of the affective dimension of the research, Biçer (2021) also indicated in his study on preschool teacher education programs that the programs should be developed to enhance emotional skills.

The review is presented with detailed tables for clearer understanding. The results are listed below. In this section, the findings derived from the tables, the sub-problems of the research, and the literature have been discussed, and conclusions have been drawn.

According to the research, each university's program qualifications, courses, course contents, learning outcomes, methods, techniques, and assessment approaches differ. Each university has applied its own methods and techniques. In this case, it can be understood that although there are Child Development departments in different universities, the program qualifications, courses, course contents, learning outcomes, strategies and methods, and assessment approaches vary.

Looking at the findings of the research, it was found that the majority of program qualifications are in the cognitive domain. When examining the steps of the cognitive domain, it was determined that the most frequent ones were application, evaluation, and synthesis, in that order. From the cognitive domain perspective, it can be said that a curriculum emphasizing higher-order cognitive actions is designed in the Child Development bachelor's programs. Regarding the affective domain, although the number of program outputs is smaller than in the cognitive domain, the most frequent steps were found to be characterizing, responding, and valuing. It can be said that although fewer program qualifications are targeted in the affective domain, higher-order tendencies are designed in the Child Development bachelor's programs. Regarding the psychomotor domain, it was determined that the program output was inadequate with only one output at the skill development level. This is considered insufficient because the fundamental concepts guiding the field of child development include cognitive, language, motor, social, and emotional development rules (NCCCDE, 2016). Therefore, more emphasis should be placed on program qualifications in the psychomotor domain, as well as in the cognitive, language, social, and emotional domains. This study found that the psychomotor domain qualification was at the higher skill development level. As a result, it can be said that program qualifications are insufficient in the important domains of emotional and psychomotor development for a child's growth. However, when considering the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains together, it is observed that the program outputs are generally high-level program outcomes. According to Tekin (1996), as one moves from the knowledge level to the evaluation level, behaviors become more complex, and acquiring these behaviors becomes more difficult. In bachelor's programs that mainly aim for higher-order tendencies, students are likely to have tendencies related to critical thinking and inquiry. Similar results have been found in different bachelor's programs. For example, Esen and Yaman (2021) studied the higher-order learning areas of Bloom's Taxonomy in Business Bachelor's Programs and stated that program outputs related to creative thinking and innovation were included. Regarding the findings of the affective dimension of the research, Biçer (2021) also indicated in his study on preschool teacher education programs that the programs should be developed to enhance emotional skills.

According to the results of the study, it was determined that most of the courses are theory-based and the number of practical and laboratory courses is insufficient. When reviewing the literature, studies that are parallel to the results of this research exist, which state that there are too many theory-based courses and too few practical courses, and that the number of practical courses should be increased. In Aksu's (2020) research, which examined the gap between theory and

practice in the field of Educational Management, it was revealed that the contents of the courses in the program were oriented toward theory and not practice. In Yeşil's (2023) research on the process of developing Science Teaching programs after the responsibility for teacher training was transferred to universities, it was stated that practical courses were insufficient. In all of these studies, it has been expressed that the number of practical courses should be increased.

When the content of the courses in the study was examined according to the TYYÇ (National Qualifications Framework for Higher Education in Turkey) areas, it was found to be distributed mainly across the fields of educational sciences, health, and social services. This result also supports the field of Child Development undergraduate programs offered at faculties of health sciences and health colleges. The educational sciences field was determined to be predominantly focused on elective courses. Due to the large number of elective courses, the course content in the educational sciences field was also extensive. Additionally, it was found that most of the course contents were theory-based. This reflects the fact that the majority of the courses are theoretical. Furthermore, it was observed that most of the practical course content was in the educational sciences area.

When examining the findings of the study, it was revealed that the majority of the courses in the Child Development undergraduate program did not recommend teaching strategies, methods, or techniques. It was determined that most of the recommended teaching strategies, methods, and techniques were primarily based on lecture, discussion, and question-answer techniques. When reviewing the literature, it was found that traditional or teacher-centered teaching strategies, methods, and techniques are more commonly used. In a study by Eren and Veyis (2023), based on the opinions of teachers and students regarding Turkish Language and Literature courses, it was found that lecture and question-answer methods were predominantly used. In a study conducted by Aliusta, Özer, and Kan (2015) with secondary school teachers in Northern Cyprus, traditional methods like lecture and question-answer were frequently used.

Considering that university education is an institution where higher-level skills should be developed, it is believed that traditional or teacher-centered teaching strategies, methods, and techniques will be insufficient for developing these skills. Literature also shows that student-centered teaching strategies, methods, and techniques are more effective than traditional or teacher-centered approaches. Ünver (2002) in his research with students studying Child Development and Preschool Teaching, revealed that teacher candidates should complete their education using student-centered teaching principles. Dikmen, Gündoğdu, Tanrıkulu, Ziyai, and Altınkaynak (2019) demonstrated that by implementing a professional development module designed by faculty members from the Faculty of Education, health faculty instructors increased the use of student-centered active learning methods in their classes, which contributed to students gaining expertise in their fields and strengthened accreditation and quality efforts.

Moreover, some studies have stated that student-centered strategies, methods, and techniques reveal positive affective characteristics in students. Özkan-Özer and Acar-Güvendir (2013) found in their study that students preferred teaching methods and techniques where they were the center of attention in measurement and evaluation courses, and these methods increased their interest and motivation. Şahin and Kılıç (2022) found that preschool teaching program students were more actively involved in problem-based learning in measurement and evaluation courses and developed positive attitudes toward the course.

According to findings from different studies, student-centered methods and techniques are believed to positively affect students' academic success and affective characteristics. In light of this, it is suggested that student-centered strategies, methods, and techniques be more prominently featured in higher education and Child Development undergraduate programs.

The results of the study revealed that most of the approaches to assessment and evaluation in the courses were based on product-oriented evaluation methods such as assignments and short answers. A review of the literature shows that traditional assessment and evaluation approaches are more commonly preferred than alternative assessment approaches in many studies. In a study conducted by Baştürk and Dönmez (2011) with prospective mathematics teachers, it was found that teacher candidates preferred traditional assessment and evaluation methods, such as written and oral exams, after conducting micro-teaching sessions as part of their planned curriculum. In a study by Şad and Göktaş (2013), when

comparing faculty members from education faculties and other faculties, it was revealed that faculty members who did not have an educational experience related to assessment and evaluation, particularly those from non-education faculties, were more likely to adopt traditional assessment and evaluation approaches.

A review of the literature shows that studies from higher education to basic education suggest that assessment and evaluation should not solely focus on product-oriented methods. Process-oriented evaluation and the use of methods that assess higher-level skills, as well as complementary or alternative assessment approaches, have been found to lead to more lasting learning and improved success. In Bahadırtaş's (2022) study on the impact of alternative assessment and evaluation methods in social studies teaching programs, it was concluded that alternative assessment and evaluation methods positively affected academic success.

In conclusion, it is believed that Child Development undergraduate programs in Turkey aim to train child development specialists with high cognitive and affective competencies. However, it is observed that there are deficiencies in the developmental areas of the program. It can be stated that the learning outcomes of the courses in the programs are insufficient to meet these competencies. This is because the learning outcomes of the courses tend to be written with a focus on lower-level tendencies. Furthermore, it can be said that the strategies, methods, or techniques used in the courses do not focus on the future child development specialists, and product-oriented assessment and evaluation approaches are more frequently preferred by instructors. In this context, it is believed that innovative strategies suitable for the modern age should be identified in the training of future child development specialists. This way, child development specialists can be better equipped.

References

Aksu, M. (2020). *Eğitim yönetimi alanında teori-uygulama boşluğu* [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Eskişehir Osmangazi University.

Aliusta, O. G., Özer, B., & Kan, A. (2015). Öğrenci-merkezli öğretim stratejilerinin Kuzey Kıbrıs'taki okullarda uygulanması. *Eğitim ve Bilim, 40*(181), 77-91. https://doi.org/10.15390/EB.2015.2822

Aytaç, A., Özbilen, F. M., & Genç, S. Z. (2021). Çocuk gelişimi lisans eğitimi ulusal çekirdek eğitim programında yer alan kazanımların yenilenmiş Bloom taksonomisine göre incelenmesi. In A. Dönger (Ed.), *Eğitim bilimleri teori, güncel araştırmalar ve yeni eğilimler 4* (pp. 1-12). IVMP.

Bahadırtaş, Ş. (2022). Sosyal bilgiler öğretmenliği lisans programında alternatif ölçme ve değerlendirme yöntem ve tekniklerinin kullanım durumu. [Unpublished master's thesis]. Erciyes University.

Başgönül, A. T. (2014). Türkiye'deki üniversitelerde tarih bölümü ve tarih eğitimi programlarının değerlendirilmesi. [Unpublished master's thesis]. Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University.

Baştürk, S., & Dönmez, G. (2011). Matematik öğretmen adaylarının pedagojik alan bilgilerinin ölçme ve değerlendirme bilgisi bileşeni bağlamında incelenmesi. *Ahi Evran Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 12*(3), 17-37.

Best, J. W., Kahn, W. C., & Jha, K. A. (2016). *Research in education*. Pearson.

Biçer, D. (2021). Okulöncesi öğretmenliği lisans programı yeterliliklerinin belirlenmesi ve yeterliliklere dayalı bir program değerlendirmesi. [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Ankara University.

Bowen, G. A. (2009). Document analysis as a qualitative research method. *Qualitative Research Journal, 9*(2), 27-40.

Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Sage.

Çepni, S. (2021). *Araştırma ve proje çalışmalarına giriş*. Ekin Yayınevi.

NCCCDE. (2016). *Çocuk Gelişimi Lisans Eğitimi Ulusal Çekirdek Eğitim Programı*. Retrieved January 25, 2024, from https://www.yok.gov.tr/Documents/Kurumsal/egitim_ogretim_dairesi/Ulusal-cekirdek-egitimi-programlari/cocuk_gelisimi_cekirdek_egitim_programi.pdf

Demirbaş, M. (2014). Bilimsel araştırma ve özellikleri. In M. Metin (Ed.), *Eğitimde bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri* (1st ed., pp. 3-19). Pegem Akademi.

Dikmen, Y., Gündoğdu, H., Tanrıkulu, F., Ziyai, N. Y., & Altınkaynak, S. (2019). Eğitim programlarının uygulanmasında öğrenci merkezli aktif öğrenme yöntemlerinin kullanılması. *1. SABAK Kongresi*, 163-167.

Durman, M., Elmas, M., Kurt, A. O., & Kenar, N. (2011). Bologna Süreci kapsamında Sakarya Üniversitesi örneği eğitim öğretim programlarını güncelleme rehberi. In D. Günay & E. Öztemel (Eds.), *Uluslararası Yükseköğretim Kongresi: Yeni Yönelişler ve Sorunlar (UYK-2011)* (pp. 478-482).

Elmas, M. (2012). Bologna süreci: Uygulama veya uygulamama. *Yükseköğretim ve Bilim Dergisi, 2*(3), 137-141.

Eren, B., & Veyis, F. (2023). Öğretmen ve öğrencilerin gözünden Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı derslerinde öğrenci merkezli yöntem ve tekniklerin kullanımı. *Karadeniz Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 15*(29), 650-671. https://doi.org/10.38155/ksbd.1376433

Karagöl, İ. (2020). Sınıf öğretmenliği lisans programının duyuşsal özellikler kazandırması bakımından Hammond değerlendirme küpü modeli ile değerlendirilmesi. [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. Anadolu University.

Karasar, N. (2020). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemi kavramlar ilkeler teknikler*. Nobel Yayıncılık.

Kızılkaya-Namlı, A. (2018). Beden eğitimi ve spor öğretmenliği lisans programının değerlendirilmesi. [Unpublished doctoral dissertation]. İnönü University.

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded source book*. Sage.

Özkan-Özer, Y., & Güvendir-Acar, M. (2013). Öğrencilerin ölçme ve değerlendirme dersinin sunulmasında tercih ettikleri öğretim yöntemleri. *Eğitimde ve Psikolojide Ölçme ve Değerlendirme Dergisi, 4*(1), 1-14.

Sözer, Y., & Aydın, M. (2020). Nitel veri toplama teknikleri ve nitel veri analizi süreci. In B. Oral & A. Çoban (Eds.), *Kuramdan uygulamaya eğitimde bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri* (1st ed., pp. 249-281). Pegem Akademi.

Şad, S. N., & Göktaş, Ö. (2013). Öğretim elemanlarının geleneksel ve çağdaş ölçme değerlendirme yaklaşımlarının incelenmesi. *Ege Eğitim Dergisi, 14*(2), 79–105.

Şahin, Ş., & Kılıç, A. (2022). Problem tabanlı ölçme ve değerlendirme dersine yönelik öğrenci görüşleri. *MSKU Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 9*(2), 333-353. https://doi.org/10.21666/muefd.969273

Tekin, H. (1996). *Eğitimde ölçme ve değerlendirme*. Yargı Yayınları.

Ünver, G. (2002). Öğretmen adaylarının öğrenci merkezli öğretimi planlama, uygulama ve değerlendirme becerilerini geliştirme. [Unpublished master's thesis]. Hacettepe University.

Üstekidağ, S. (2021). Okul öncesi eğitim programları kazanımlarının yenilenmiş Bloom taksonomisine göre incelenmesi (1989-1994-2002-2006-2013). [Unpublished master's thesis]. İstanbul Aydın University.

Yaman, H., & Esen, M. (2021). Yükseköğretimde yaratıcı düşünme ve inovasyon eğitimi: İşletme lisans programları bağlamında bir inceleme. *Üniversite Araştırmaları Dergisi, 4*(3), 262-278. https://doi.org/10.32329/uad.930995

Yeşil, E. (2023). Öğretmen eğitimi programlarının üniversitelere devredilmesi sonrası fen bilgisi lisans programlarının geliştirilmesine ilişkin öğretim elemanlarının görüşleri. [Unpublished master's thesis]. Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University.

Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2021). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. Seçkin Yayıncılık.